

EAST AYRSHIRE COUNCIL

SOUTHERN LOCAL PLANNING COMMITTEE - 19 MAY 2000 00/0183/LB : PROPOSED REPLACEMENT OF WINDOWS IN FRONT ELEVATION AT 77 MAIN STREET, OCHILTREE

APPLICATION BY MR HOWES

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY SHEET

1. DEVELOPMENT DESCRIPTION

1.1 Listed Building Consent is sought for the replacement of existing Georgian style timber sash and case windows on the front elevation of the dwellinghouse. It is proposed to replace the existing windows on the front elevation with UPVC sliding sash windows. The windows would have glazing bars to reflect the existing Georgian style windows.

2. RECOMMENDATION

2.1 It is recommended that the application be refused on the grounds listed on the attached sheet.

3. SUMMARY OF ANALYSIS

3.1 In terms of the East Ayrshire Local Plan, Finalised Version, the proposed development conflicts with the provisions of Policies ENV4.

3.2 It is considered that the installation of Upvc windows in this building would be detrimental to both the character and appearance of the building itself and the visual amenity of Ochiltree Conservation Area.

3.3 The installation of uPVC windows on the building is contrary to the guidance given in the Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas 1998. Furthermore the use of uPVC windows is objected to by the Scottish Civic Trust and Architectural Heritage Society of Scotland.

**Alan Neish
Head of Planning and Building Control**

Note: This document combines key sections of the associated report for quick reference and should not in itself be considered as having been the basis for recommendation preparation or decision making by the Planning Authority.

EAST AYRSHIRE COUNCIL

SOUTHERN LOCAL PLANNING COMMITTEE - 19 MAY 2000 00/0183/LB : PROPOSED REPLACEMENT OF WINDOWS IN FRONT ELEVATION AT 77 MAIN STREET, OCHILTREE

APPLICATION BY MR HOWES

Report by Head of Planning and Building Control

1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

1.1 The purpose of this report is to present for determination a planning application which is to be considered by the Local Planning Committee under the scheme of delegation as the proposal is contrary to policy, is subject to objection and is recommended for refusal.

2. APPLICATION DETAILS

2.1 **Site Description:** The site is located on the south side of Main Street, Ochiltree and comprises the existing dwellinghouse and curtilage at its location. The two-storey dwellinghouse has a frontage to Main Street, Ochiltree. The dwellinghouse has random stone, patched with cement to the front, a west dash render on other elevations, slate roof and timber windows and doors.

2.2 The dwellinghouse is a Category B Listed Building and lies within Ochiltree Conservation Area.

2.3 **Proposed Development:** Listed Building Consent is sought for the replacement of existing Georgian style timber sash and case windows on the front elevation of the dwellinghouse. It is proposed to replace the existing windows on the front elevation with UPVC sliding sash windows. The windows would have glazing bars to reflect the existing Georgian style windows.

3. CONSULTATIONS AND ISSUES RAISED

3.1 Ochiltree Community Council have not responded to the consultation letter.

Noted.

3.2 The Scottish Civic Trust object to the application as a matter of principle. As a matter of principle, the existing fabric of listed buildings should always be repaired and not replaced, and this includes windows. In the vast majority of cases, existing sash and case windows can be successfully repaired, and usually at a fraction of the cost of replacement windows. If replacement is absolutely necessary, then a 'like for like' replacement should be sought. and this would mean timber rather than a modern material.

The applicant wishes to replace the existing windows with uPVC windows rather than refurbish the existing windows. The applicant has gone some way to replacing the windows 'like for like' by proposing a window which reflects the existing windows in terms of opening and appearance. It is considered however, that the use of uPVC on a Listed Building is not appropriate. It is noted that other listed buildings within Ochiltree Conservation Area, both Category C(S) and Category B, have uPVC windows installed. These appear however to have been installed without the appropriate consents, and does not justify use of uPVC in this instance.

3.2.1 The Trust would also wish to note its objection to the use of uPVC as a material for not just in Listed Buildings, but in general terms as well. We would wish to bring to the attention of the Council, and indeed the applicant, the report by Greenpeace called "Look Out" on the issue of uPVC windows. This reports fully on the unsuitability of the material. We are also aware that the Association of UK Firemasters supports the non-use of this type of material.

Noted.

3.3 The Architectural Heritage Society objects to the application. Although we are aware it is now possible to find a uPVC window design that replicates the traditional profiles and proportions of a timber construction this is not suitable for a Listed Building.

See Section 3.2.

3.3.1 The Architectural Heritage Society also has the following comments to make on the choice of material.

- (i) It does not last as long as timber – usually guaranteed for only ten years;
- (ii) Its brash whiteness does not interact well with traditional subtleties;
- (iii) Its non-sustainable – being subject to unit failure, it must then be replaced when non-repairable;
- (iv) It bio-degrades in ultra-violet light when it can discolour and also warp;
- (v) It is a pollutant on disposal and is banned in some parts of Europe.

Noted.

4. REPRESENTATIONS

4.1 The Scottish Civic Trust and Architectural Heritage Society of Scotland have objected to the proposed development as outlined in Section 3.2 and 3.3 of the report.

5. DEVELOPMENT PLAN STATUS

5.1 The relevant policy document is the East Ayrshire Local Plan, Finalised Version. The applicant site is affected by residential and environment policies.

5.2 The proposed development does not conflict with the provisions of residential policies appropriate to the application site.

5.3 Environment Policy ENV4 states that: The Council will seek to ensure that all development within or affecting the setting of a Conservation Area or affecting the appearance or setting of a Listed Building, is sympathetic to the area or building concerned in terms of its layout, size, scale, design, siting, materials and colour of finish. Wherever possible, all proposals should seek to preserve, enhance or incorporate features, which contribute positively to the character or appearance of the area and have due regard to the architectural and historic qualities of the area or building concerned.

The replacement of windows with uPVC windows is in appropriate in a Listed Building and in a Conservation Area, and approval of the application would be contrary to the provisions of Policy ENV4.

5.4 Design Guidance for the East Ayrshire Local Plan has yet to be agreed. The relevant design guidance is therefore contained within the Finalised Cumnock and Doon Valley District Plan.

5.5 The Development Control Document relating to Listed Buildings and Buildings within Conservation Areas, has specific policies regarding replacement windows which state that:-

- (i) all replacement windows must be of traditional design and have traditional methods of opening;
- (ii) all replacement windows must be of timber construction with window frames being painted in colours to be agreed with the Planning Authority;
- (iii) all replacement windows must reflect the style and proportion of original windows being replaced. In particular, the proportion of top-to-bottom sashes and the pattern of glazing bars and astragals must be retained and reproduced;
- (iv) all replacement windows on the front elevation of a building within a Conservation Area or on other elevations which are open to view must meet the criteria above. Only in exceptional cases where it can be reasonably justified will consideration be given to the use of uPVC or aluminium windows which are located on elevations of the building which are not readily visible. In all cases, windows that are proposed in non-traditional material must still be of traditional style and design.

Whilst the replacement windows would meet criteria (i) and (iii), they would not meet all of the criteria. The proposal is consequently contrary to the above policy.

6. OTHER PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

6.1 Historic Scotland's '*Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas 1998*' gives detailed advice on consideration of applications within Conservation Areas.

6.2 Paragraph 1.2.4 states that modern substitutes for timber windows should be firmly discouraged. Paragraph 1.2.11 further states that the damage which may be caused by the replacement of any window, which is historically and architecturally correct, with a modern unit made from a different material, to a different design or with a different method of opening is potentially immense. Any proposal which will result in the diminution of architectural quality, no matter how small should be refused.

The use of uPVC is contrary to the advice given in the 'Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas 1998'.

6.2 Listed Building Consent (CD/91/239/LBC) and Planning Consent (CD/92/67) for a rear extension to 77 Main Street were approved by the former Cumnock and Doon Valley District Council. These approvals had a condition imposed requiring the windows of the proposed extension be of wooden construction and sash and case design.

Noted.

6.3 Should the Committee be minded to approve the Listed Building consent application, it will not require to be forwarded to the Scottish Ministers for a final decision as the property is a Category B Group Listed Building.

6.4 Should the Committee be minded to approve the application, it would not represent a significant departure from policy and the application would not require to be referred to the Development Services Committee under the scheme of delegation.

7. FINANCIAL AND LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

7.1 There are no financial or legal implications for the Council in the determination of this application.

8. CONCLUSIONS

8.1 In terms of the East Ayrshire Local Plan, Finalised Version, the proposed development conflicts with the provisions of Policies ENV4.

8.2 It is considered that the installation of uPVC windows in this building would be detrimental to both the character and appearance of the building itself and the visual amenity of Ochiltree Conservation Area.

8.3 The installation of uPVC windows on the building is contrary to the guidance given in the Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas 1998. Furthermore the use of uPVC windows is objected to by the Scottish Civic Trust and Architectural Heritage Society of Scotland.

9. RECOMMENDATION

9.1 It is recommended that the application be refused on the grounds listed on the attached sheet.

Alan Neish
Head of Planning and Building Control
VE/SMB
3 May 2000
FV/AN

LIST OF BACKGROUND PAPERS

1. Application form and plans.
2. Statutory Notices and Certificates.
3. Consultation responses.
4. Representations.
5. East Ayrshire Council Local Plan, Finalised Version.
6. Cumnock & Doon Valley District Wide Local Plan.
7. Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Building and Conservation Areas 1998.

Any person wishing to inspect the background papers listed above should contact Miss Vivien Emery on 01563 555485.

Implementation Officer : Alan Neish

Application no: 00/0183/LB

Location	77 Main Street, OCHILTREE
Nature of Proposal:	Proposed replacement of windows in existing front elevation
Name and Address of Applicant:	Mr Howes, 77 Main Street OCHILTREE KA81 2PE
Name and Address of Agent	

DPO's Ref:	[VIVIEN EMERY]
	PPO's Ref; []

The above LISTED BUILDING application should be refused on the following grounds.

1. The proposed installation of UPVC windows in this listed building within Ochiltree Conservation Area No. 1 is contrary to the Council's policies for Replacement of Windows on a building within a Conservation Area which state:-
 - (i) All replacement windows must be of traditional design and have traditional methods of opening;
 - (ii) All replacement windows must be of timber construction with window frames being painted in colours to be agreed with the Planning Authority;
 - (iii) All replacement windows must reflect the style and proportion of top-to-bottom sashes and the pattern of glazing bars and astragals must be retained and reproduced;
 - (iv) All replacement windows on the front elevation of a building within a Conservation Area, or on other elevations which are open to view must meet the criteria above. Only in exceptional cases where it can be reasonably justified will consideration be given to the use of UPVC or aluminium windows and only then if the windows are located on elevations of the building which are not readily visible. In all cases, windows that are proposed in non-traditional materials must still be of traditional style and design.

2. The proposed installation of UPVC windows would be unsympathetic to and also detrimental to the character of the building. The proposal is therefore contrary to Policy ENV4 of the East Ayrshire Local Plan, Finalised Version which states that there shall be protection of heritage resources requiring conservation from unsympathetic developments.

**DUE TO ORDNANCE SURVEY REGULATIONS AND COPYRIGHT
THE MAP IS AVAILABLE FOR VIEWING AT THE COUNCIL'S
PLANNING OFFICE IN LUGAR. FOR INFORMATION ON
VIEWING PLEASE CONTACT (01563) 555320.**

AGENDA